Principals’ Social and Emotional Competence: A Key Factor for Creating Caring Schools

Julia Mahfouz, Mark T. Greenberg, & Amanda Rodriguez

This issue brief, created by The Pennsylvania State University, is one of a series of briefs that addresses the future needs and challenges for research, practice, and policy on social and emotional learning (SEL). SEL is defined as the process through which children and adults acquire and effectively apply the knowledge, attitudes, and skills necessary to understand and manage emotions, set and achieve positive goals, feel and show empathy for others, establish and maintain positive relationships, and make responsible decisions. This is the second series of briefs that address SEL, made possible through support from the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation. The first set synthesized current SEL research on early support for parent engagement and its effects on child outcomes; SEL in infancy/toddlerhood, the preschool years, the elementary school period, and middle-high school timeframes; and how SEL influences teacher well-being, health equity, and school climate. Learn more at prevention.psu.edu/publications/type/534.
Executive Summary

School principals have substantial impacts on many aspects of their schools, including school climate and culture, teacher well-being and retention, and students’ school success. As such, the personal and professional development of principals is a key element in creating a caring school in which adults and children feel welcomed, cared for, and challenged. It is now recognized that principals experience substantial job-related stress which can compromise their personal well-being as well as their leadership. Surprisingly, the social and emotional development and well-being of principals has received little attention.

This brief provides a conceptual model of the Prosocial School Leader, which has two components. The first is the principal’s own social and emotional competence (SEC) and the ability to handle stress and model caring and culturally competent behaviors with staff and students. The second component is an enhanced model of leadership in which principals are the prosocial leaders whose responsibility is to ensure that all staff, students, parents, and community members feel safe, cared for, respected, and valued. Principals’ SECs, well-being, and leadership form the foundation that influences the effective implementation of social and emotional learning (SEL), school climate, teacher functioning and well-being, family and community partnerships, and downstream student outcomes.

This brief reviews the research on principal stress, coping, and positive school leadership. However, the research is currently thin, especially on how principals’ professional development, preparation programs, and certification standards can be strengthened to improve principal well-being and school outcomes. We review various strategies to enhance effective leadership by supporting principals to deepen their social and emotional competencies, all of which set the foundation for student success. We conclude with a series of recommendations on research, programs, and policies to build this field and improve the lives of principals for effective prosocial leadership.

Introduction

The role of the principal in U.S. schools has become increasingly complex over the past two decades of educational reform. Principals substantially influence student well-being and achievement as well as the lives of teachers and other staff. In a recent survey, state-level educational policymakers overwhelmingly reported that school principals play a central role in supporting social and emotional learning (SEL) and in creating healthy, caring schools. Currently, SEL is recognized as an essential component of education viewed by educators and policymakers as foundational to school success and student learning outcomes.

In the current educational environment characterized by growing social inequality, violence, bullying and aggression, and high stakes-accountability, principals are recognizing the value of SEL for improving their skills as leaders, building a caring school climate, and improving student performance. In a recent national survey, 98% of K–12 principals agreed that SEL skills are teachable and recognize that SEL could help promote equality and reduce educational disparities; however, they also reported needing substantial guidance on how to implement...
SEL. This lack of training and confidence to support students’ SEL was confirmed in a 2017 Gallup Poll. In a 2018 survey, over 90% of principals felt that student learning and applying SEL skills was very important and most principals saw SEL as a priority for their school.

Principals experience substantial job-related stress, yet they often lack the guidance and resources necessary to develop their own social and emotional competencies (SECs) that could help them respond appropriately. A large proportion of principals feel that they lack the requisite skills to effectively lead their schools, and high turnover rates create a significant financial and operational burden. We assert that by developing the five social and emotional skills framed by the Collaborative for Academic, Social, and Emotional Learning (CASEL), which include the ability to regulate their emotions and behavior, increase their social awareness, cultivate healthy relationships, and improve their decision-making skills, principals can increase their effectiveness and develop the skills to lead the implementation of SEL programs, policies, and practices in their buildings and throughout the school community.

The Prosocial School Leader – A Focus on Social Emotional Skills

Here, we present a conceptual model of the Prosocial School Leader. As shown in Figure 1, this model has two components. The first is the principal’s own social and emotional competence and ability to handle stress and model caring and socially and culturally competent behaviors with staff and students. The second component focuses on an enhanced model of leadership in which principals are the prosocial leaders whose responsibility is to ensure that all staff, students, parents, and community members feel safe, cared for, respected, and valued. In this model, principals’ SECs, well-being, and leadership form the foundation that influences school climate, which involves adult-student relationships, teacher functioning and well-being, family and community partnerships, and downstream student outcomes. We also suggest various strategies to enhance effective leadership by helping principals deepen their social and emotional competencies, all of which set the foundation for student success.

Figure 1. The prosocial school leader (Mahfouz, Greenberg, Weissberg, Chi, & Turksma, under review).
Principals are responsible for the complex task of creating a caring, healthy school climate that is welcoming, supportive, culturally affirming, and respectful of all members of the school community. Principals lay the foundations for positive relationships among the stakeholders of the schools, especially those relating to relations among students, teachers, and the community. Figure 1 illustrates how principals’ SECs, well-being, and leadership influence school climate, which in turn influences social, emotional, and academic outcomes for teachers and students. We believe that this occurs through four important mediators.

**Effective leadership**

When principals have strong SECs, they tend to be effective leaders who manage their buildings by adopting a positive, proactive style. Principals who have high self-awareness can recognize how their values, beliefs, and emotions support their interactions with others.\(^{19-21}\) One study found that principals’ supportive behaviors were associated with higher levels of teacher emotion regulation ability and job satisfaction, which are important factors in reducing teacher burnout.\(^ {22}\) Moreover, principals who accurately identify emotions tend to exhibit greater leadership toward change.\(^ {23}\) By questioning their knowledge base and assumptions, principals become aware of inequities that may limit students’ potential and opportunities. As a result, students, staff, and families develop a greater sense of belonging to the school and its mission.

**Healthy relationships**

Principals who build healthy, trusting relationships with teachers, and exhibit caring and encouragement, foster positive school climates that support social emotional and academic outcomes for students.\(^ {24,25}\) Principals who promote an ethic of care\(^ {26,27}\) intentionally develop authentic relationships and support teachers’ emotional needs.\(^ {28}\) By listening with full
attention and approaching decisions with an open and accepting attitude, principals can create caring school climates, and help teachers develop the skills necessary to exhibit these same qualities with their students.29

Effective family and community partnerships

Principals who focus on SECs are more likely to create a welcoming atmosphere for parents and community agencies. They can build strong partnerships with families, which are essential to school improvement, and see families as essential to the competence of their children.30-33 A principal’s relational style and cultural competency significantly influence parents’ decisions regarding getting involved in their children’s schools.34-38 Principals with strong SECs also build positive relationships with their communities, including strong connections with out-of-school programs, community agencies that serve families and provide behavioral/mental health services to children and youth, and key community stakeholders including local non-profits and businesses.39-42

Effective SEL implementation

Since principals with strong SECs model these skills and attitudes in their interactions with others and recognize their importance, we propose that they are better able to lead the implementation of SEL programs, policies, and practices than principals with less well-developed SECs. Such principals are more likely to naturally become SEL leaders who foster caring, healthy school cultures with high expectations for teacher and student competence/achievement.

Although the four mediators in Figure 1 are hypothesized to have strong downstream effects, a variety of contextual factors also may influence both principals’ behavior and overall school performance. These factors include budgets, community culture, levels of student disadvantage, policies and regulations, or personal issues affecting students, teachers, or school leaders.

Principals’ social emotional competencies and well-being

Being a principal is a high-stress profession, and stress levels are increasing in the current educational environment, with negative effects on job performance, well-being, turnover, and school outcomes.47-50 Principal effectiveness can be undermined by the failure of states and districts to recognize the emotional load of the position and develop programs to help leaders.51-53 Reflecting the high stress and low support associated with the position, principals in urban schools remain in their positions for just 3 to 4 years,54 which is often not long enough to impact their school’s success.

Principals have numerous roles as the leaders of complex systems.55 In the past decade their responsibilities and concerns have been compounded by budget concerns, an overzealous focus on student test scores as the primary measure of principal effectiveness, new models of teacher evaluation, a heightened state of fear due to school violence, and concerns about students’ mental health.12 In addition, principals are expected to serve as instructional leaders who implement complex, politically charged change initiatives while also preparing students to handle the complexities of the 21st century.47,56,57
The pressure on principals is considerable and many work approximately 60 hours per week. Those who do not effectively cope with these stressors are at risk for developing health problems such as high blood pressure, substance abuse, and weight gain. Principals who feel emotionally exhausted report lower job satisfaction, exercise less frequently and sleep more poorly, miss more days of work, and report higher likelihood of quitting their jobs. In short, many principals are on the path to burnout, with repercussions for job performance and mental and physical health that lead to feelings of inadequacy, disillusionment, and lack of efficacy which eventually result in principals leaving the profession. Principal attrition negatively impacts student achievement and drives inequities in principal quality across the states. The cycle of stress is further fueled by principals’ concerns about burnout and stress among teachers, which lead to teacher attrition. Schools with high principal and teacher turnover experience instability, which negatively impacts student learning. As stress intensifies, principals’ self-efficacy can decrease; as burnout intensifies principals may begin to doubt their ability to fulfill their duties.

Awareness and understanding of one’s emotions may support leaders’ efforts to develop self-understanding and to strengthen relationships with others, which contribute to growth and improved communication. Thus, understanding one’s emotions is a critical leadership skill. In the education context, Yamamoto et al. found that principals who engage in self-reflection to regulate their emotions are better able to manage school crises. However, most principal preparation programs do not teach the skills necessary to help principals regulate their emotions and effectively handle the stress they will encounter as school leaders.
Positive school leadership

Effective leaders not only exhibit acceptance, compassion, trust, and patience, but also are positive, caring, and empathic.\textsuperscript{69,71} Being an empathic leader requires being a good listener and remaining fully present, even in difficult situations. Such leaders remain open to new experiences and are sensitive to school and community concerns.\textsuperscript{29,72} Effective principals serve as leaders of learning by helping strengthen teacher effectiveness and maximizing academic learning time,\textsuperscript{73} and ensuring alignment between curriculum and instruction. To do so, they promote continuous improvement through staff professional development and actively participate as learners themselves.\textsuperscript{2}

By sharing accountability with other school stakeholders, principals create collaborative communities, enabling teachers, students, and parents to shape and drive improvement efforts.\textsuperscript{74-76} According to Fullan,\textsuperscript{77} effective leaders facilitate school improvement by communicating and committing to a clear vision (which quite often challenges the status quo) and proactively implementing school improvement initiatives.

As shown in a 10-year longitudinal study, relational trust between school leaders and staff is foundational to school success and healthy relationships with the community.\textsuperscript{36} Principals’ relationship-oriented behaviors set the tone for interpersonal interactions and model how emotions and attitudes are communicated within the school community.\textsuperscript{52} Principals who express compassion and caring, and provide emotional support, foster a positive culture that strengthens self-efficacy and enables teachers to focus on their passion for teaching.\textsuperscript{51,78,79}

Effective implementation of SEL

Principals play a critical role in the selection, effective implementation, and sustainability of SEL programs, policies, and practices.\textsuperscript{80} In one study monitoring the implementation of a new SEL curriculum, greater levels of principal support for SEL curriculum implementation led to lower levels of student aggression and increased student SECs.\textsuperscript{81} Similarly, principal support for SEL programs was a key factor in program sustainability.\textsuperscript{82} Principals who create and maintain positive and trusting relationships with school stakeholders can facilitate the implementation of school reforms such as SEL programs.\textsuperscript{36}

Emerging Strategies to Support SEL for School Leaders

Research has demonstrated that principals with strong emotional well-being and SECs exhibit effective leadership, develop healthy relationships, and establish family and community partnerships that facilitate effective school-wide SEL implementation. These components are critical to sustaining a caring, healthy, positive, welcoming, and safe school climate that fosters positive social emotional and academic outcomes for students.\textsuperscript{70} In this section we discuss a variety of potential actions, including policies, professional development programs, and practices that might be taken to strengthen the SEC and SEL
leadership capabilities of principals. Although most of the actions described below have not yet been well-studied, we believe they represent promising directions for addressing the issue at hand. Recent large initiatives focusing on preparing school leaders without a defined emphasis on the principal’s own well-being or his/her role as the prosocial school leader have shown small effects on student achievement. In one study that demonstrated achievement gains, the intervention showed no impact on teacher ratings of overall school climate and led to lower teacher retention.

Professional development programs for school leaders

Although many leadership programs in the business world focus on SECs, few professional development programs focus on SECs for principals. Thus, professional development programs are needed to: (a) cultivate school administrators’ own SECs and (b) support school administrators to lead SEL implementation effectively.

Mindfulness-based interventions. Training on mindfulness practices may help principals develop SECs. Mindfulness practices have been shown to yield many physical, psychological, and emotional benefits, including decreased stress, and increased health, mental flexibility, attention, and emotion regulation capacity. Research on mindfulness-based professional development for teachers has proliferated in recent years; although this is a new area of research and practice, findings thus far are promising. A mindfulness-based professional development program originally designed to support teachers was recently modified to support principals. Cultivating Awareness and Resilience in Education (CARE) was designed to nurture educators’ self-awareness and to help them understand and regulate their emotions with the goal of improving health and well-being. The program is based on three major instructional components: mindfulness and awareness practices (40%), emotion skills (40%), and caring and compassion skills (20%). Recently, Mahfouz studied the implementation of CARE with principals in a rural school district in central Pennsylvania. CARE for School Leaders involved 20 hours of group training over four weeks with a booster session four weeks after implementation. After completing the CARE program, principals reported improvements in leadership skills, relationships, self-care, increased self-awareness, ability to regulate emotions, self-management, and self-compassion. Although these findings appear promising, experimental research is needed to investigate the effects of mindfulness programs by examining the links to teacher and student well-being and school climate.

Emotional intelligence training. Given research evidence that principals’ emotion recognition abilities are related to transformational behaviors, preparation and professional development programs should aspire to develop these abilities. Several innovative training programs have been developed but further research is still needed. One program, Leading Schools with Heart and Mind, is designed to develop school leaders’ EQ competencies. The program includes 15 hours of instruction and is divided into four modules: (a) self as leader, (b) building trust, (c) increasing professional capacity, and (d) leading for educational equity. Martinez and colleagues followed a group of participating principals in an urban school district in California for one school year and demonstrated the importance of
EQ skill acquisition as a developmental component for effective school leaders. EI training for principals is also a component of the RULER SEL program, but there is no research yet demonstrating its effectiveness.

**Systems thinking and SEL.** Recently, Goleman and Senge proposed a Triple Focus Model for schools. This model concentrates on emotional intelligence, developing compassion for self and others, and an emphasis on systems-level thinking. Such an approach focuses both on the mindful awareness of the individual, but also on using systems thinking and tools to understand the larger social field. In the education context, the larger social field is a school’s organizational culture, including its system of beliefs and values and the norms, rituals, and routines by which they are communicated. Such an approach is as yet untested.

**Coaching/mentoring models**

In various fields of leadership, including education, significant value has been found in peer-to-peer networks of support and learning. Although there is no available research demonstrating the potential benefits of peer-to-peer communities (either local or online) specific to EI or the Prosocial School Leader model, such longer-term learning communities may be a beneficial approach in need of evaluation. While shorter-term professional development programs may support principals to cultivate SECs and become prosocial leaders, there also is a need to sustain principals over long periods of time as part of the learning-application process. It is likely that a model that combines both a face-to-face and online professional learning community might have the greatest impact. Creating a learning process of one to two years that combines some of the above ideas (mindfulness, EI, leadership) might be most likely to be sustained overtime. Such models need to be developed and tested.

**Pre-service principal preparation programs**

Presently, there are no principal preparation programs for school leadership programs with the specific prosocial leader orientation espoused here. However, there is substantial flexibility in principal program development under the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA). Black and colleagues designed a principal professional training program focused on relational leadership. This approach of Appreciative Inquiry is similar to Fullan’s model, which focuses on moral purpose, understanding change, relationship building, a knowledge culture, and coherence making. The appreciative model adds a sixth focus on whole system coherence and resilience. In a broader sense, preparation programs could play a critical role in helping support principals’ own SEC and the integration of SEL into their schools.

**Policy change to support prosocial school leaders**

National and state boards can also support the development of principals’ SECs by embedding SEL within school leadership policies such as standards, licensures, accreditation, evaluation, or in-service programs. Currently, new initiatives are being developed to strengthen principal preparation and professional development programs (e.g., *Initiative for Systemic Program Improvement through Research in Educational*...
Leadership [INSPIRE]. In addition, new professional standards for educational leaders were adopted by the National Policy Board for Educational Administration in November 2015 to replace the Interstate School Leaders Licensure Consortium (ISLLC) standards adopted in 2008. To better reflect principals’ knowledge, skills, and abilities, the 10 new standards emphasize the importance of “promoting each student’s academic success and well-being.” Although the standards emphasize students’ well-being, they do not address principals’ well-being. Given the important role of principals as positive role models, this is a serious oversight.

Creating greater stability of principal assignments

Research clearly indicates that organizational conditions such as low mobility among both adults and students may also promote relational conditions that are conducive to caring. Principal turnover is a great concern given the critical role played by principals in leading long-term school improvement efforts, as schools plagued by turnover exhibit lower commitment to improvement. Principal turnover leads to teacher turnover which causes dissatisfaction and “burnout” and decreases the possibility of satisfying, caring relationships. This especially affects schools in high-poverty neighborhoods that have greater student mobility. Constant reshuffling of principals, common in many U.S. districts, is a policy that needs to be re-examined. Research should be conducted on the effectiveness of maintaining effective principals in their schools.
Recommendations

Research has demonstrated that principals often deal with highly stressful emotional situations in ways that compromise their ability to develop and sustain healthy relationships with school stakeholders, lead effectively, build strong relationships with the community, and support SEL programs at their schools. We provide the following recommendations for researchers, practitioners, and policymakers with the goal of advancing principals’ own SEL and their leadership to create caring schools.

1. Extend research by developing and testing SEL programs focused on principals and using randomized controlled trials to test and evaluate their efficacy. Such programs should evaluate the proximal outcomes of the social and emotional, knowledge, skills, and leadership activities of principals as well as their ability to effectively implement SEL programs and policies in their schools. Studies also should examine the intermediate outcomes of academic pressure and school climate, including teacher well-being. Finally, studies should examine the distal student academic and social emotional outcomes. It also is important to understand how culture and context may influence the effectiveness of such programs. This research also should explore how various contexts and cultural differences may affect the implementation process and results at the school level.

2. Conduct experimental and case studies to examine associations hypothesized by the Prosocial School Leader model that have not yet been fully explored in the literature.

3. Include professional development programs and courses that focus on principals’ own SEL and school leadership as part of principal preparation programs. Conduct evaluation studies to better understand the nature of their impact on and benefits for principals receiving this kind of professional development.

4. Create state, district, and school policies and guidelines that ensure principals have the necessary support for the effective implementation of SEL programs and policies in their schools. Such policies and guidelines could bring support through embedding SEL in strategic plans, budgets, and curricula, developing SEL standards, and investing in providing SEL teams to assist school leaders in rolling out SEL efforts.

Authors and Affiliations

Julia Mahfouz, Ph.D., is an assistant professor in the educational leadership program, Department of Leadership and Counseling, University of Idaho. Mark T. Greenberg, Ph.D., is Emeritus Professor at the Pennsylvania State University and the Founding Director of the Edna Bennett Pierce Prevention Research Center. Amanda Rodriguez is Principal of the Clark Elementary School in the Cleveland Metropolitan School District.

The authors gratefully acknowledge Joseph Murphy and Janet Patti for their helpful comments on an earlier version of this brief.

Suggested Citation


About the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation

For more than 40 years the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation has worked to improve health and health care. We are working with others to build a national Culture of Health enabling everyone in America to live longer, healthier lives. For more information, visit www.rwjf.org. Follow the Foundation on Twitter at www.rwjf.org/twitter or on Facebook at www.rwjf.org/facebook.

About The Pennsylvania State University

Founded in 1855, The Pennsylvania State University is a renowned public research university that educates students from around the world and collaborates with partners to share valuable knowledge that improves the health and well-being of individuals, families, and communities. For more information, visit www.psu.edu.
References


